

VIA ECF

The Honorable Arun Subramanian
 United States District Judge
 United States District Court, Southern District of New York
 500 Pearl Street, Courtroom 15A
 New York, NY 10007

April 27, 2025

Re: *United States, et al. v. Live Nation Entertainment, Inc., et al.*, No. 1:24-cv-03973

Dear Judge Subramanian:

Plaintiffs write to more fully explain Plaintiffs' opposition to Defendants' request that the Court grant Defendants a two-week extension of Defendants' deadline to respond to Plaintiffs' motion concerning bifurcation. ECF No. 525.

Plaintiffs' expert disclosures are due on July 28, 2025. The Court's ruling on Plaintiffs' motion to bifurcate will have a significant impact on the scope of those expert disclosures. As Defendants note, the bifurcation motion will raise substantial and complex issues concerning the way in which this case will be tried. Plaintiffs respectfully submit that a further two-week extension of the briefing schedule for this motion will either truncate the time the Court has to consider the motion or require Plaintiffs to submit one or more expert reports in July with opinions that may be premature.

Plaintiffs raised the issue of bifurcation on February 18, 2025. It then took two months for Defendants to give a firm position on bifurcation. Plaintiffs advised the Court that bifurcation was a live issue during the March 13, 2025 status conference and the Court set a briefing schedule that called for opening briefs to be filed by April 14, 2025. On April 3, Defendants for the first time made a counterproposal, which the Parties discussed in two separate meetings. Plaintiffs sought an extension of the April 14 deadline because, despite Defendants' delay in responding, once they provided some details on their position, the Parties were able to engage in constructive discussions that suggested that an agreement potentially was within reach and that motion practice could be avoided.

Defendants have articulated no good reason why the Court's usual briefing schedule provides insufficient time for Defendants to file a response. Defendants are well-aware—after months of meeting and conferring—of Plaintiffs' position on bifurcation. Defendants have now had more than ample time to solidify their position on bifurcation and hone their arguments. While the parties might have joined issue on trial structure sooner had Defendants provided a more complete explanation of their position, they cited case law in support of it as early as March 7. As our forthcoming motion will make clear, Plaintiffs disagree with Defendants' legal position, but they had evidently researched it. With no deadline modification, they will have had another two months since then to further refine that position.

Accordingly, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court deny Defendants' two-week extension request.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Bonny Sweeney
BONNY SWEENEY
Lead Trial Counsel
United States Department of Justice
Antitrust Division
450 Fifth Street N.W., Suite 4000
Washington, DC 20530
Telephone: (202) 725-0165
Facsimile: (202) 514-7308
Bonny.Sweeney@usdoj.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff United States

/s/ Robert A. Bernheim

Robert A. Bernheim (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Office of the Arizona Attorney General
Consumer Protection & Advocacy Section
2005 N. Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004
Telephone: (602) 542-3725
Fax: (602) 542-4377
Email: Robert.Bernheim@azag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arizona

/s/ Amanda J. Wentz

Amanda J. Wentz (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Arkansas Attorney General
323 Center Street, Suite 200
Little Rock, AR 72201
Telephone: (501) 682-1178
Fax: (501) 682-8118
Email: amanda.wentz@arkansasag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arkansas

/s/ Paula Lauren Gibson

Paula Lauren Gibson (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Attorney General
(CA Bar No. 100780)
Office of the Attorney General
California Department of Justice
300 South Spring Street, Suite 1702
Los Angeles, CA 90013
Telephone: (213) 269-6040
Email: paula.gibson@doj.ca.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of California

/s/ Conor J. May

Conor J. May (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust Unit
Colorado Department of Law
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
Telephone: (720) 508-6000
Email: Conor.May@coag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Colorado

/s/ Kim Carlson McGee

Kim Carlson McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of Connecticut
165 Capitol Avenue
Hartford, CT 06106
Telephone: 860-808-5030
Email: kim.mcgee@ct.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Connecticut

/s/ Elizabeth G. Arthur

Elizabeth G. Arthur (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General for the District of
Columbia
400 6th Street NW, 10th Floor
Washington, DC 20001
Email: Elizabeth.arthur@dc.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff District of Columbia

/s/ Lizabeth A. Brady

Lizabeth A. Brady
Director, Antitrust Division
Florida Office of the Attorney General
PL-01 The Capitol
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050
Telephone: 850-414-3300
Email: Liz.Brady@myfloridalegal.com
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Florida

/s/ Richard S. Schultz

Richard S. Schultz (Admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Illinois Attorney General
Antitrust Bureau
115 S. LaSalle Street, Floor 23
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Telephone: (872) 272-0996
Email: Richard.Schultz@ilag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Illinois

/s/ Jesse Moore

Jesse Moore (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Indiana Attorney General
302 W. Washington St., Fifth Floor
Indianapolis, IN 46204
Telephone: 317-232-4956
Email: Jesse.Moore@atg.in.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Indiana

/s/ Noah Goerlitz

Noah Goerlitz (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Iowa Attorney General
1305 E. Walnut St.
Des Moines, IA 50319
Telephone: (515) 281-5164
Email: noah.goerlitz@ag.iowa.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Iowa

/s/ Christopher Teters

Christopher Teters (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Public Protection Division
Office of Kansas Attorney General
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor
Topeka, KS 66612-1597
Telephone: (785) 296-3751
Email: chris.teters@ag.ks.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Kansas

/s/ Mario Guadamud

Mario Guadamud (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Louisiana Office of Attorney General
1885 North Third Street
Baton Rouge, LA 70802
Telephone: (225) 326-6400
Fax: (225) 326-6498
Email: GuadamudM@ag.louisiana.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Louisiana

/s/ Schonette J. Walker

Schonette J. Walker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Antitrust Division
200 St. Paul Place, 19th floor
Baltimore, Maryland 21202
Telephone: (410) 576-6470
Email: swalker@oag.state.md.us
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Maryland

/s/ Katherine W. Krems

Katherine W. Krems (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Division
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney General
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
Boston, MA 02108
Telephone: (617) 963-2189
Email: Katherine.Krems@mass.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Massachusetts

/s/ LeAnn D. Scott

LeAnn D. Scott (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Corporate Oversight Division
Michigan Department of Attorney General
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, MI 48909
Telephone: (517) 335-7632
Email: ScottL21@michigan.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Michigan

/s/ Zach Biesanz

Zach Biesanz
Senior Enforcement Counsel
Antitrust Division
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1400
Saint Paul, MN 55101
Telephone: (651) 757-1257
Email: zach.biesanz@ag.state.mn.us
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Minnesota

/s/ Gerald L. Kucia

Gerald L. Kucia (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Special Assistant Attorney General
Mississippi Office of Attorney General
Post Office Box 220
Jackson, Mississippi 39205
Telephone: (601) 359-4223
Email: Gerald.Kucia@ago.ms.gov.
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Mississippi

/s/ Justin C. McCully

Justin C. McCully (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection Bureau
Office of the Nebraska Attorney General
2115 State Capitol
Lincoln, NE 68509
Telephone: (402) 471-9305
Email: justin.mccully@nebraska.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nebraska

/s/ Lucas J. Tucker

Lucas J. Tucker (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Senior Deputy Attorney General
Office of the Nevada Attorney General
Bureau of Consumer Protection
100 N. Carson St.
Carson City, NV 89701
Email: ltucker@ag.nv.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Nevada

/s/ Zachary Frish

Zachary A. Frish (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection & Antitrust Bureau
New Hampshire Attorney General's Office
Department of Justice
1 Granite Place South
Concord, NH 03301
Telephone: (603) 271-2150
Email: zachary.a.frish@doj.nh.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Hampshire

/s/ Yale A. Leber

Yale A. Leber (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Attorney General
Division of Law
Antitrust Litigation and Competition
Enforcement
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
Newark, NJ 07101
Telephone: (973) 648-3070
Email: Yale.Leber@law.njoag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Jersey

/s/ Bryan L. Bloom

Bryan L. Bloom
Senior Enforcement Counsel
New York State Office of the Attorney General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
Telephone: (212) 416-8598
Email: Bryan.Bloom@ag.ny.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of New York

/s/ Jeff Dan Herrera

Jeff Dan Herrera (*pro hac vice pending*)
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection Division
New Mexico Department of Justice
408 Galisteo St.
Santa Fe, NM 87501
Telephone: (505) 490-4878
Email: JHerrera@nmdoj.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of New Mexico

/s/ Brian D. Rabinovitz

Brian D. Rabinovitz (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Special Deputy Attorney General
North Carolina Department of Justice
Post Office Box 629
Raleigh, North Carolina 27602
Telephone: (919) 716-6000
Facsimile: (919) 716-6050
Email: brabinovitz@ncdoj.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of North Carolina

/s/ Sarah Mader

Sarah Mader (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust Section
Office of the Ohio Attorney General
30 E. Broad St., 26th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Telephone: (614) 466-4328
Email: Sarah.Mader@OhioAGO.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Ohio

/s/ Robert J. Carlson

Robert J. Carlson (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection Unit
Office of the Oklahoma Attorney General
15 West 6th Street
Suite 1000
Tulsa, OK 74119
Telephone: 918-581-2230
Email: robert.carlson@oag.ok.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oklahoma

/s/ Gina Ko

Gina Ko (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust, False Claims, and Privacy Section
Oregon Department of Justice
100 SW Market St.,
Portland, Oregon 97201
Telephone: (971) 673-1880
Fax: (503) 378-5017
Email: Gina.Ko@doj.oregon.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Oregon

/s/ Joseph S. Betsko

Joseph S. Betsko (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Chief Deputy Attorney General
Antitrust Section
Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
Strawberry Square, 14th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17120
Telephone: (717) 787-4530
Email: jbetsko@attorneygeneral.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

/s/ Paul T.J. Meosky

Paul T.J. Meosky (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Special Assistant Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
Telephone: (401) 274-4400, ext. 2064
Fax: (401) 222-2995
Email: pmeosky@riag.ri.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

/s/ Danielle A. Robertson

Danielle A. Robertson (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of South Carolina
P.O. Box 11549
Columbia, South Carolina 29211
Telephone: (803) 734-0274
Email: DaniRobertson@scag.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of South Carolina

/s/ Bret Leigh Nance

Bret Leigh Nance (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
1302 E. Hwy 14, Suite 1
Pierre SD 57501-8501
Email: bretleigh.nance@state.sd.us
Telephone: (605) 773-3215
Bar # 5613
Attorney for Plaintiff State of South Dakota

/s/ Hamilton Millwee

Hamilton Millwee (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General and Reporter
P.O. Box 20207
Nashville, TN 38202
Telephone: (615) 291-5922
Email: Hamilton.Millwee@ag.tn.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Tennessee

/s/ Diamante Smith

Diamante Smith (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General, Antitrust Division
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
P.O. Box 12548
Austin, TX 78711-2548
Telephone: (512) 936-1162
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Texas

/s/ Marie W.L. Martin

Marie W.L. Martin (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Deputy Division Director,
Antitrust & Data Privacy Division
Utah Office of Attorney General
160 East 300 South, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 140830
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-0830
Telephone: 801-366-0375
Email: mwmartin@agutah.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Utah

/s/ Sarah L. J. Aceves

Sarah L. J. Aceves (*pro hac vice* forthcoming)
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection and Antitrust Unit
Vermont Attorney General's Office
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609
Telephone: (802) 828-3170
Email: sarah.aceves@vermont.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Vermont

/s/ David C. Smith

David C. Smith (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of Virginia
202 North 9th Street
Richmond, Virginia 23219
Telephone: (804) 692-0588
Facsimile: (804) 786-0122
Email: dsmith@oag.state.va.us
Attorney for Plaintiff Commonwealth of Virginia

/s/ Ashley A. Locke

Ashley A. Locke (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Antitrust Division
Washington Office of the Attorney General
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
Seattle, WA 98104-3188
Telephone: (206) 389-2420
Email: Ashley.Locke@atg.wa.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Washington

/s/ Douglas L. Davis

Douglas L. Davis (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Protection and Antitrust Section
West Virginia Office of Attorney General
P.O. Box 1789
Charleston, WV 25326
Telephone: (304) 558-8986
Fax: (304) 558-0184
Email: douglas.l.davis@wvago.gov
Attorney for Plaintiff State of West Virginia

/s/ Laura E. McFarlane

Laura E. McFarlane (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Assistant Attorney General
Wisconsin Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7857
Madison, WI 53707-7857
Telephone: (608) 266-8911
Email: mcfarlanele@doj.state.wi.us
Attorney for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin

/s/ William T. Young

William T. Young
Assistant Attorney General
Wyoming Attorney General's Office
109 State Capitol
Cheyenne, WY 82002
Telephone: (307) 777-7841
Email: william.young@wyo.gov
Attorney for the Plaintiff State of Wyoming

FOR DEFENDANTS:

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

/s/ Alfred C. Pfeiffer

Alfred C. Pfeiffer (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Co-Lead Trial Counsel for
Live Nation Entertainment, Inc. and
Ticketmaster L.L.C.
Timothy L. O'Mara (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Jennifer L. Giordano
Andrew M. Gass (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Lindsey S. Champlin (admitted *pro hac*
vice)
Kelly S. Fayne (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Robin L. Gushman (admitted *pro hac vice*)

505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
San Francisco, CA 94111-6538
(415) 391-0600

555 11th Street NW, Suite 1000
Washington, D.C. 20004
(202) 637-2200

Al.Pfeiffer@lw.com
Tim.O'Mara@lw.com
Jennifer.Giordano@lw.com
Andrew.Gass@lw.com
Lindsey.Champlin@lw.com
Kelly.Fayne@lw.com
Robin.Gushman@lw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Live Nation
Entertainment, Inc. and Ticketmaster L.L.C.*

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

/s/ David R. Marriott

David R. Marriott
Co-Lead Trial Counsel for
Live Nation Entertainment, Inc. and
Ticketmaster L.L.C.
Lauren A. Moskowitz
Jesse M. Weiss
Nicole M. Peles

Two Manhattan West
375 Ninth Avenue
New York, NY 10001
(212) 474-1000

dmarriott@cravath.com
lmoskowitz@cravath.com
jweiss@cravath.com
npeles@cravath.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Live Nation
Entertainment, Inc. and Ticketmaster L.L.C.*